Friday, October 17th, 2014
10:00 am - 11:30 am

WRITING AND REVISING PROGRAM LEARNING OUTCOMES

Shannon Milligan; Coordinator of Assessment
Faculty Center for Ignatian Pedagogy

Carol Scheidenhelm; Director
Faculty Center for Ignatian Pedagogy
ASSESSMENT CERTIFICATE PROGRAM (ACP)

- Collaboration between Loyola and DePaul, Academic Affairs, Student Development, and Academic Support
- Workshops:
  - Core content focused on the assessment cycle
  - Don’t have to sign up for ACP to participate in workshops
  - Can take a few workshops and decide to sign up for the ACP!
  - We will be adding more workshops
ASSESSMENT CERTIFICATE PROGRAM (ACP)

- Requirements:
  - Attendance at 6 workshops:
    - Intro to Assessment (at home campus) *does not have to be taken first*
    - Four workshops that you select (at DePaul or Loyola)
    - Final Workshop (at home campus)
  - Visit http://acp.depaultlao.org/ to:
    - Sign up for the ACP
    - Sign up for individual workshops
    - Suggest future workshop topics
    - Volunteer to present/co-present
WORKSHOP AGENDA

• Definition and Purpose of Learning Outcomes

• Considerations When Writing Learning Outcomes

• How to Write Effective Learning Outcomes
WORKSHOP OBJECTIVES

Participants will be able to . . .

• Distinguish between learning outcomes and related concepts
• Distinguish between levels of learning outcomes
• Identify relevant considerations when writing learning outcomes
• Write effective learning outcomes
Definition and Purpose of Learning Outcomes
LEARNING OUTCOMES & YOU
WHAT IS A LEARNING OUTCOME?

A statement in specific and measurable terms of what a student will know or be able to do as the result of having successfully completed a program.
CHARACTERISTICS OF LEARNING OUTCOMES (MAKI, 2010)

• Describes what a student should be able to demonstrate, represent, or produce

• Relies on active verbs

• Aligns with collective program and institutional level educational intentions
PURPOSE OF LEARNING OUTCOMES

• Learning outcomes inform students of what knowledge and skills they will gain through the course of a program of study.

• They indicate what knowledge, skills and abilities students will have mastered (and the level of mastery) at the end of their course of study.

• They communicate expected standards of performance.

• They provide a structure for evaluating student learning.
RELATED (BUT DIFFERENT) CONCEPTS

Learning Goals and Domains

Learning Objectives

Expectations

Performance Metrics
# LEARNING OUTCOMES VS. PERFORMANCE METRICS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Learning Outcomes</th>
<th>Performance Metrics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Derived from mission and purpose</td>
<td>Derived from description of the work of department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measures contributions to student learning (was the experience transformative?)</td>
<td>Measure performance of the work (did students complete a task?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Achievement = Effectiveness</td>
<td>Achievement = Productivity, Satisfaction or Accomplishment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Require criteria to define levels of effectiveness</td>
<td>Require criteria to define levels of performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Individual and collective feedback to shape department programs and services</td>
<td>Individual feedback to shape department systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assessment: how effective were we?</td>
<td>Assessment: how well did we perform our tasks?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Is the train headed in the right direction?</td>
<td>Is the train on time?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Are students learning something?</td>
<td>Are students satisfied with our programs and services?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Considerations for Writing Learning Outcomes
LAYERS OF LEARNING OUTCOMES

University Goals

College/School/Divisional Learning Outcomes

Departmental Learning Outcomes

Program Learning Outcomes

Course/Activity-Based Learning Outcomes
LEVELS OF LEARNING OUTCOMES

• College/School/Divisional Learning Outcomes
  allows for integration, shared responsibility for student learning across departments

• Departmental Learning Outcomes
  students can learn through multiple programs and services offered within the department

• Programmatic Learning Outcomes
  students can achieve through participating in one or more courses, activities, or services within one program area of a department

• Course/Activity-Based Learning Outcomes
  students can achieve through participation in a singular activity or service at one point in time
LEVEL OF SPECIFICITY

Learning gets more specific; reach becomes more restricted
WHAT DO WE MISS WHEN WE ARE SO FOCUSED?
“KSAVES”

When constructing learning outcomes, consider the essential:

Knowledge
Skills
Abilities
Values
Ethics

*and experiences

students should possess by the time they complete a program, then “operationalize”
PRACTICE-READY!

- What are the most important things for students to learn in the program? (#1 on the outcome writing template)
- What will students need to be able to do to take the next step after they graduate from the program (work, continuing education, etc.)? (#2 on the outcome writing template)
Writing Effective Learning Outcomes
BEST PRACTICES IN WRITING LEARNING OUTCOMES

• Student-centered
• Clear and concise
• Use action verbs
• Manageable number
• Tied to core curricular and co-curricular mission/goals/values

What are Characteristics of Good Student Learning Outcomes?; http://condor.depaul.tia/Learning/what.html
BEST PRACTICES IN WRITING LEARNING OUTCOMES

• Measurable
• Observable
• (Realistically) Aspirational/Developmental (at the right level for your students)
• Transferrable
• Meaningful
IF LEARNING OUTCOMES WERE MATH...

- Basic formula:

  Students + will (or will be able to) + action verb
  (target audience) (future tense) (measurable behavior)

  + learning statement
  (what students will know or be able to do)

  = learning outcome!
ADDING TO THE EQUATION

• Outcomes can also include:
  • Degree of achievement
    • Quantification (e.g. number of examples needed)
    • Standard (e.g. without making any errors)
  • Criteria
    • Using what tool or activity (e.g. using RefWorks, through case studies)
  • Conditions
    • Specification of the course/activity/program (e.g. “As a result of participating in the workshop on diversity, students…”)

http://assessment.uconn.edu/primer/goals1.html
http://www.uta.edu/ier/Resources/ABCD_Outcome_Writing_Model.pdf
http://ets.tlt.psu.edu/learningdesign/objectives/writingobjectives
EXAMPLE LEARNING OUTCOMES

• As a result of the workshop, students will name the four ways of Interfaith Dialogue

• Students will be able to apply knowledge of assessment, content delivery, and communication strategies in designing their own online courses

• Students will analyze Chicago housing data using multiple regression
TOOLS THAT HELP DISTINGUISH LEVELS OF LEARNING

- Bloom’s Taxonomy: Cognitive
- Bloom & Krathwohl’s Taxonomy: Affective
BLOOM’S TAXONOMY: COGNITIVE DOMAIN

Knowledge (Remembering)

Comprehension (Understanding)

Application (Applying)

Analysis (Analyzing)

Synthesis (Evaluating)

Evaluation (Creating)

IGNATIAN PEDAGOGICAL PARADIGM: EXPERIENCE

- Evaluation
- Synthesis
- Analysis
- Application
- Understanding
- Knowledge

Source: Ignatian Pedagogy: A Practical Approach
## COGNITIVE DOMAIN VERBS

### Knowledge
- **Definition**: Ability to recall previously learned material.
- **Sample Verbs**: identify, label, recall, reproduce, state

### Comprehension
- **Definition**: Ability to show a basic understanding of material.
- **Sample Verbs**: define, describe, explain, paraphrase, provide example

### Application
- **Definition**: Ability to apply learning in new situations.
- **Sample Verbs**: apply, demonstrate, determine, prepare, use

### Analysis
- **Definition**: Ability to logically differentiate between the content and structure of material.
- **Sample Verbs**: analyze, compare/contrast, differentiate, distinguish, investigate

### Synthesis
- **Definition**: Ability to create new content and structures.
- **Sample Verbs**: construct, create, design, develop, generate

### Evaluation
- **Definition**: Ability to judge the value of material for a given purpose.
- **Sample Verbs**: assess, critique, evaluation, justify, support

---

BLOOM’S & KRATHWOHL’S TAXONOMY: AFFECTIVE DOMAIN (IPP: EXPERIENCE, REFLECTION, ACTION)

### AFFECTIVE DOMAIN VERBS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Receiving</th>
<th>Responding</th>
<th>Valuing</th>
<th>Internalizing Values</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Being aware of or sensitive to ideas or phenomena.</td>
<td>Actively responding to or showing new behaviors as a result of new ideas or phenomena.</td>
<td>Showing involvement or commitment.</td>
<td>Acting in accordance with the new value.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sample Verbs:**
- Accept
- Acknowledge
- Attend
- Listen
- Observe
- Clarify
- Contribute
- Question
- React
- Respond
- Demonstrate
- Join
- Justify
- Participate
- Support
- Commit
- Modify
- Prioritize
- Reconcile
- Synthesize
- Act
- Display
- Exhibit
- Perform
- Practice

COMMON PITFALLS

- Using “understand,” “have knowledge of,” “be aware of,” “appreciate”…
- Including how an outcome will be measured in the text of an outcome (can limit to only one way to measure)
- Focusing on yourself rather than the student
- Too many outcomes
- Not enough outcomes
- Complex outcomes that actually address multiple concepts (that would require separate methods of assessment)
ACTIVITY

- Individually or in small groups, take 5 minutes to draft at least one learning outcome (final page of the outcome writing template)
DIGGING DEEPER
TIPS FOR PROGRAM LEARNING OUTCOMES (AND ABOVE): WRITING

• Ensure that they map to the curriculum, co-curriculum, and education practices that offer multiple and varied opportunities for students
• Have faculty/staff collaboratively author and collectively accept
• Incorporate or adapt professional organizations’ outcomes statements (as appropriate)
• Can be quantitatively and/or qualitatively assessed
• Ideally focus on higher-order skills (e.g. creation, evaluation)

From: Maki (2010)
TIPS FOR PROGRAM LEARNING OUTCOMES (AND ABOVE): WRITING

• Look for themes in course learning outcomes across the program

• Capture influence of more general outcomes (e.g. college or institution-wide)

• Look at what other programs are doing

• Concept mapping

From: Maki (2010)
TIPS FOR WRITING PROGRAM LEARNING OUTCOMES (AND ABOVE): ALIGNMENT

- Ensure program learning outcomes and courses/course learning outcomes align by using a curriculum map
COURSE/ACTIVITY-BASED LEARNING OUTCOMES: ALIGNMENT

Backward Design (Wiggins and McTighe)

1. Learning outcomes
2. How to assess learning outcomes
3. Activities to bring about the learning outcomes
COURSE/ACTIVITY-BASED LEARNING OUTCOMES: ALIGNMENT

Integrated Course Design (Fink)

- Learning Outcomes
- How to assess learning outcomes
- Activities to bring about the learning outcomes

Context (Situational Factors)
ACTIVITY!
ASSESS THIS OUTCOME!

For each of the following Learning Outcomes:

• Is this a good learning outcome?
• If not, how could it be rewritten to be better?
Students demonstrate a reasonably high degree of competency of technical execution appropriate to the chosen medium.
All xxxxx majors will learn the role technology and the new media are playing in the current and future worlds of news gathering and dissemination. Our course work will emphasize that the arrival of internet and broadband technology as well as satellite and videotape technology is as significant in its own way as the Gutenberg Revolution and the introduction of the telegraph were to the future of journalism. Each has accelerated the news cycle as never before and challenged journalists to get the news fast and to get it right. Our students will learn how to do both.
Students who participate in leadership development or leadership training initiatives will determine how leadership theories or models inform their leadership.
Knowledge of Contracts
In this program, students will acquire core knowledge in a particular technology discipline.
Students who participate in fighting injustice (direct service, advocacy, activism) will engage in critical reflection and identify current local, national, and/or global social justice issues.
Questions about Writing Learning Outcomes?
RESOURCES FOR WRITING LEARNING OUTCOMES

At Loyola:
- Faculty Center for Ignatian Pedagogy
  - Carol and Shannon
- Student Development
  - Mike Beazley

At DePaul:
- Office for Teaching, Learning, and Assessment
  - Associate Director, Assessment
  - TLA website: [http://condor.depaul.edu/tla/Learning/creating_outcomes.html](http://condor.depaul.edu/tla/Learning/creating_outcomes.html)
  - Teaching Commons: [http://teachingcommons.depaul.edu/Course_Design/developing_a_course/goals.html](http://teachingcommons.depaul.edu/Course_Design/developing_a_course/goals.html)
- Student Affairs
  - Associate Vice President for Assessment, Planning, and Communications
  - Assessment Coordinator